That is why the House has constituted a Committee to go into the laying of papers. It is a very serious matter. So, I through you, Mr. Minister, tell the Government that all the Ministers, while laying papers on the Table of the House, should not take it casually and that they should take it seriously because we have very vigilant Members in the Rajya Sabha who look at every comma and fullstop. So, for your own safety, you should be very well-prepared by people who brief you. This is my ruling. It should not happen the next time.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: They help the Government in funcitoning properly.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, they help the Government because in this way the Members make the Government also vigilant about the issue. It is a good thing. Yes, Shri Satpal Maharaj.

Notification of the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI SATPALJI MAHARAJ): Madam I lay on the Table, under Seciton 199 of the Railways Act, 1989 a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) Notificaiton G.S.R. No. 267(E) dated the 4th July, 1996 publishing the Railways Red Tariff (54th Amendment) Rules, 1996. (Placed in Library. *See* No. LT. 432/96)

REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON HOME AFFAIRS

SHRI SOM PAL (UTTAR PRADESH): Madam, I present a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Committee on Home Affairs—

(i) Thirty-second Report on the Demands for Grants (1996-97 of the Ministry of Home Affirs;

(ii) Thirty-third Report on the Demands for Grants (1996-97) of the ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions; and

(iii) Thirty-fourth Report on the Demands for Grants (1996-97) of the Ministry of Law, Justice and Company Affaris.

REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON INDUSTRY

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, this is about the Reports of the Department-Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Industry. Yesterday, there was a dispute about it. I heard both the parties and then I had a discussion with the hon. Chiarman. I prepared my report and showed it to the hon. Chairman. In the light of the report, I had another discussion with the hon. Chairman. The hon. Chairman said that the Reports should be laid on the Table of the House. So, Shri Ashok Mitra, please.

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE (Maharashtra): What about my objections?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, I had discussions with the hon. Chairman, later on with you and then again with Mr. Ashok Mitra. The footnote that is given in the Committee's Report is sufficient.

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: मैडम मैंने तो आपको सिर्फ इतना ही कहा था वह पैराग्राफ अगर नहीं विदड्रा करना चाहते है तो मेरा जो नोट आफ डिसेंट है, उसको तो अपनी रिपोर्ट में इन्सर्ट करें। आप मेरा राइट भी छीनना चाहते हैं?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not taking away anybody's right. But according to the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Committees, which have been laid down by the hon. Chairman, it is correct. That's all and whatever the hon. Chairman's directions are, I am doing it accordingly.

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: मैडम, रूल बुक आप देखिए, इसमें जो दिया हुआ है रूल नंबर 274, इसमें सब-रूल नंबर 3 है। इसमें बड़ा क्लियरकट लिखा हुआ है कि जब तक आप इसको इम्पीमेंट नहीं करेंगे, मेंबर के राईट को आप कैसे रोकेंगे? मैंने उसके अंतर्गत ही नोट ऑफ डिस्सेंट दिया है। अगर मेरा नोट आ ॅफ डिस्सेंट रिपोर्ट में नहीं इंक्लूड करते हैं तो

What is the meaning of that?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your note of dissent relates to discussion on a particular subject. Now that note of dissent is being taken care of by the Chairman. The Chairman has said that he is in his right what protion of a thing should become part of the note of dissent. In your note of dissent you have stated that matter was not discussed, but the Chairman said that the mere fact that you gave a note of dissent shows that the matter was discussed.

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Madam.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me finish. The mere fact that you dispute and you gave a note of dissent on that matter shows that it was discussed in the Committee.

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: When was it discussed?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Secondly, the rule says that no motivations or aspersions of any kind should be put in a note of dissent. There are certain points in your note of dissent which were objected to by the Chairman. The Chairman of the Committee was authorised by the Committee and by the Chairman to delete whatever he feels does not come within that.

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: मैडम, मैंने ऐसी कोई बात अपनी चिट्ठी में नहीं लिखी है और इस चीज को इतना बड़ा बनाकर अगर मेरा ऑफ डिस्सेंट बुलडोज करना चाहेंगे.....(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Not you, Madam.

महोदया, अगर चेयरमैन ऑफ दि कमेटी इसको बुलडोज करना चाहेंगे तो यह दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण बात होगी.....(व्यवधान) मैडम, मैं फिर दोहराऊंगी कि इस रिपोर्ट के साथ मेरे नोट ऑफ डिस्सेंट को अपेंड कर लीजिए वरना इसके कोई माने नहीं होते हैं.....(व्यवधान) इसके कोई माने नहीं होते हैं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Look, I have prepared the report according to the facts and as per the rules. If you have any objection.....

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Yes, I have.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you have any objection, then I would give a chance to the Chairman of the Committee to put his viewpoint as to what he wants to say in this respect.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (West Bengal): I would not like to make any comment on the proceedings of the meeting, but I would like to make a general observation with regard to the procedural aspect. So far as the note of dissent of any Parliamentary committee is concerned, it is the prerogative of a Member to give his note of dissent. First it has to be decided by the Chairman of the Committee in what form the note of dissent will be accommodated and incorporated in the text of the report. If there is a dispute between the Chairman and a Member of the Committee, then the normal practice is that in respect of Committees relating to Lok Sabha it is referred to the Speaker and for Committees relating to Rajya Sabha it is referred to the Chairman. So far as the Chairman's ruling on laying the report on the Table is concerned, I am not disputing it. His decision is final. But, the manner in which a note of dissent is to be disposed of should be decided. If there is a difference of opinion between the Chairman and a Member of the Committee, then that difference should be referred to the hon. Chairman and the hon. Chairman should take a view on this. Thereafter, the report should be prepared. But unfortunately, here the cart is placed before the horse.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No it is not so. Yesterday I had a discussion on this subject. At that time, Miss Khaparde gave her viewpoint and the Chairman of the Committee and one other Member who came before me also gave their viewpoint. According to their viewpoint and in the light of directions which are already there for the working of the Committee, I prepared a report. I showed it to the hon. Chairman and the hon. Chairman has given his ruling saying that this is correct and the report should be placed on the Table of the House. That note is there. I would send a copy of that note to both the Members and they can have a look at it. If you like, I can send it to you.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI (KERALA): Madam, I want to point out that this matter was referred to the hon. Chairman only when yesterday Miss Khaparde stood up and objected to the laying of this report.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know it.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: What Mr. Pranab Mukherjee has suggested is that it should have gone to the hon. Chairman before it was listed for laying on the Table of the House.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: There are two aspects, Madam. One aspect is, so far as laying the report on the Table is concerned, I do agree that the Chairman's ruling is final when he has said that it has to be laid on the Table of the House. But the other aspect is how to dispose of a difference in a Committee and about the incorporation of a note of dissent by a Member. if there is a dispute between the Chairman and a Member, it should be decided either by you, Madam, or the Chairman before the report is finalised. This is the point I am suggesting. That is why i said it is placing the cart before the horse. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If there is a note of dissent by one of the Members of the Committee—here it is Miss Saroj Khaparde—and if she was objecting to it as it was not included in the report, the paper should not have been listed yesterday to be laid on the Table of the House. Not today, but yesterday. It was listed yesterday and that is why Miss Khaparde had to raise it on the floor of the House. I agree with you. I direct the Secretariat that in future if there are any such occasions where a member has a dispute regarding a report or regarding the working of a committee, the matter should be referred to the hon. Chairman and then after taking his direction it should be listed to be placed on the Table. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: It will have to be referred by the Chairman of the Committee to the Chairman of the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SATISH AGARWAL (Rajasthan): It is for the Chairman of the Standing Committee to refer it to the hon. Chairman when there is a dispute. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Or the Member...*(Interruptions)* In future the procedure should be that if there is a dissent or a dispute, it should not be listed for laying on the Table. Either the Chairman of the Committee or the Member should take the matter to the hon. Chairman of the Rajya Sabha for a decision and when the dispute is settled, then only it should be laid on the Table of the House. Now, the matter is over. *(Interruptions)*

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Madam, it is not over now. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): Madam, a point of order. I want your specific ruling on this, Madam. I do not know anything on what Mr. Pranab Mukherjee, my senior leader, spoke. If there is a dispute in the Committee, that should be referred to the Speaker or to the Chairman. The point is, it is the right

of the Member of a Committee to write a dissent note or to approve of the report. It is the right of a Member. Here the Rule Book very clearly says—Rule 274: "(i) Report of the Standing Committee shall be passed on broad consensus; (ii) Any Member of the committee may record a minute of dissent on the report of the committee. The report of the committee together with the minutes of dissent, if any, shall be presented to the House." The point is, now a Member has given a note of dissent. Without informing her or without calling her and asking as to why she is submitting a note of dissent and without discussing anything with her, he has given a negative reply to her after getting the draft passed and after getting the approval, that too in her absence. And now this thing is listed here. Where is the other position? When this right is snatched from the Member, why are you keeping this rule in the book? Remove it. Remove it if you do not want to do it. The House is supreme, it can remove this clause. But under this clause the Member gets his right.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA): Do not say that removal is the solution. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: The point is, you are not implementing it. If you are not implementing it, you remove it. When this clause is there, my right is there. Why have you not acted? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: I do not see any reason to remove it. I am with you. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JAYANT KUMAR MALHOUTRA (Uttar Pradesh): I am also a Member of this Committee, Madam. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: It does not matter whether one is a member of that Committee or not. It is a matter of the entire House. It is a matter of the right of Members. Not of one committee. *(Interruptions)*

LOCATION PROJECTS

If the Chairman of one Committee behaves like this, then the Chairmen of other Committees would also do the same thing. After all, it is a property of the House ...*(Interruptions)*...

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: मैंने नोट आफ डिसेन्ट दिया है। (...व्यवधान...) चेयरमैन आफ द स्टैंडिंग कमेटी को लिखा है। (...व्यवधान...) उसके बावजूद भी यह हंगामा होता है तो यह दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण बात है। मैंने नोट आफ डिसेन्ट अपने मन से नहीं लिखी हुई है। मैंने उनकी नजर में यह बात लाने के बाद When he told me, 'you write a note of dissent. I would see to it that it is incorporated in the report', only then did I write my note of dissent.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shall I read out the direction of the Chairman? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: They cannot do like this ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute. There is no need to be agitated. I will just refer to the direction which the hon. Chairman has given. It says:

> "A minute of dissent on the report of a Committee shall be couched in temperate and decorous language and shall not refer to any discussion in the Committee nor cast aspersions on the Committee or the Chairman of the Committee."

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: मैंने कोई भी इस तरह की टिप्पणी नहीं की है। मैंने किसी उद्देश्य के साथ किसी लेंग्वेज का उपयोग नहीं किया हुआ है। अगर मेरे कहे शब्दों से किसी को चोट पहुंचती है तो मैं अपने उन शब्दों को वापस लेने के लिए तैयार हूं लेकिन आन वन कंडीशन कि मेरी नोट ऑफ डिसेन्ट उस रिपोर्ट के साथ इनकारपोरेट होनी जरूरी है। अगर मुझे सदन की सदस्या के नाते रूल्स आफ प्रोसीजर में यह अधिकार दिया हुआ है तो उसका मान-सम्मान करना आपका कर्तव्य है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Well, Mr. Malhoutra would like to say something. Mr. Malhoutra, you say whatever you like. I will leave the matter to the

hon. Chairman. If the two parties are agreeable...

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: मैडम, आप वरबेटिम नोट मंगा कर देख लीजिए। उसके बावजूद भी अगर आपको लगता है कि जो कुछ मैंने किया है या लिखा है वह गलत साबित हो रहा है तो आप मुझे जो रूलिंग देंगी, वह मुझे मंजूर है।

SHRI JAYANT KUMAR MALHOUTRA: Madam, I have something to add to this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Miss Khaparde, I can understand your agitation. You see, I have gone into the matter in great detail. I have discussed the matter with the hon. Chairman. The hon. Chairman has given a noting also. If you still have any objection... (*interruptions*)...

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: I still have.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. If you have got some objection to the Chairman's decision, I would request you to appeal before the Chairman. I have no objection because it is his ruling.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Madam, we have got the Calling Attention.

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: मैडम, चेयरमैन साहब का अन्तिम निर्णय मुझे मान्य होगा। मैं चेयरमैन साहब के निर्णय के बारे में कुछ नहीं कह रही हूं। अगर मेरी लैंग्वेज से किसी को दुख पहुंचता है तो मैंने जो शब्द वहां पर इस्तेमाल किए हैं, वह ऐसे नहीं हैं जो आपत्तिजनक हों। मैं उसकी गहराई में नहीं जाना चाहूंगी with the consent of the Chairman of the Standing Committee...

जब मैंने उनको कहा कि इस पैराग्राफ में, मैं आपसे सहमत नहीं हो रही हूं तो उन्होंने मुझे मीटिंग में कहा था कि you are free to write a note of dissent. On the very same day, I saw to it that my note of dissent reached him.

उसके बाजवूद उन्होंने कब उसकी ड्राफ्टिंग की इसके बारे में मुझे कोई जानकारी नहीं है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let Mr. Malhoutra speak... (*Interruptions*)..

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Why did he not take me into confidence?

SHRI JAYANT KUMAR MALHOUTRA: Madam Deputy Chairman, I am also a Member of this Committee. Mis Khaparde's dissent note is in three parts. In the first part—we were present during the meeting—she has said that if the whole House is of the opinion that this should be included, this particular part of the dissent note should be included, she will go along with that. As far as the second part of her note of dissent is concerned, it was deleted by the Chairman of our Committee. In the third part of her note of dissent, there were certain aspersions which we all would have objected to because there were certain aspersions. Therefore, this was not included. This was discussed here. You prepared a note which was shown to the hon. Chairman. It does reflect the correct position. I think it is properly taken care of... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: A note of dissent may not be...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The issue is, I have done my duty. If the hon. Members still have some objection, they can appeal before the Chairman. I have done my duty to the best of my ability by hearing both the people. I presented my report to the hon. Chairman. If they are not satisfied, they may again approach the hon. Chairman. I cannot say about what should be done and what should not be done because the hon. Chairman himself has seen the note and made a noting on it. If they have any dispute on the procedure, they can take it up with the Chairman. I have read out his noting. I don't want to read the letter which Miss Khaparde or Mr. Ashok Mitra has written because that should not become... (*Interruptions*)...

This is not the only Committee which is functioning here. There are many other Standing Committees whose reports will be presented to the House. I, as Deputy Chairperson of this House, feel that we should not make more of this issue on the floor of the House. Let the matter be settled in the chamber of the Chairman

because we should not set wrong precedents....(*Interruptions*)...

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: मैं अभी फिर खड़ी हुई हूं, इस मुद्दे पर खड़ी हुई हूं (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति: चेयरमैन साहब ने देख लिया है (**व्यवधान**)

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: महोदया, मुझे आपकी प्रोटेक्शन की आवश्यकता है (**व्यवधान**) रूल 274 के बारे में निर्णय देने वाली वेरियस डिपार्टमेंट रिलेटिड पार्लियामेंटरी कमेटीज़ कौन होती हैं? (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Madam, rule 274...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have read it ...(*interruptions*)...

I showed it to the hon. Chairman...(*Interruptions*)... If you are not satisfied with it, you can make a reference again. ...(*Interruptions*)... There you will be making a complaint to an authority. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Madam, I will not allow this Report to be laid....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MD. SALIM (West Bengal): This is not fair. ...(*Interruptions*)... The hon. Member is saying that she would not allow..... I am strongly objecting to it....(*Interruptions*)... Only the Chair has that authority. ...(*Interruptions*)...

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे: इतनी आपत्तिजनक आवाज़ करने की कोई आवश्यकता नहीं है। मेरा मतलब यह है कि मैं रिपोर्ट पेश होना अलाऊ नहीं करूंगी। इसका कारण मैंने यह कहा कि जब तक मेरे नोट आफ डिसेंट को एक्सेप्ट नहीं करेंगे तब तक के लिए मैंने कहा। रिपोर्ट पर मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है। (**व्यवधान**)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sarojji, I have explained to you in very clear words that this matter was put before the hon. Chairman. The hon. Chairman has gone into it and he has given his note on the Report. He has permitted these papers to be laid on the Table of the House. So, I am bound by that directions of the Chairman. If you have any dispute, you may refer it to the hon. Chairman; but, just now...(*Interruptions*)... I cannot help it. If you ...(*Interruptions*)... Once I have the direction, I have the direction....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Madam, we can postpone it till Monday. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MD. SALIM: It is not possible, Madam....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We will seek an appointment to meet the Chairman...(*Interruptions*)... The Members must get the opportunity to meet the Chairman. ...(*Interruptions*)... It will be in the interest of natural justice. ...(*Interruptions*)... Give us an opportunity to meet the Chairman and explain to him. ...(*Interruptions*)... Madam, I seek your protection. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: With regard to your objection, I read out the direction. In his wisdom the Chairman felt that this note of Miss Khaparde was not properly drafted, so it could not be a part of the annexures of the Report. That is the reason why the Chairman explained and he has put a note ...(*Interruptions*)... I am just telling you what has happened. ...(*Interruptions*)... This is not my viewpoint. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Madam, just one clarification....(*Interruptions*)... May I understand that the Chairman in his direction has overruled the note of dissent given by Miss Khaparde? ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, Mr. Mukherjee, you are not understanding the direction. ...(*Interruptions*)... The direction which I just read out is a printed direction to the Committees working ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Madam, my point is that under rule 274...(*Interruptions*)... Madam, as per rule 274, a note of dissent is the prerogative of a Member. If the Chairman comes to the conclusion that the form in which a note of dissent has been indicated is not the proper form and, therefore, it should

not be a part of the Report—if that becomes a direction—I can accept it. I would like to know from you as I am not going into the merits—I am just going into the procedural aspect—that when a Member would put a note of dissent and if the Chairman of the Committee finds that it is not a proper note of dissent and it cannot be incorporated in the report, then how to resolve that dispute?
The only way of resolving this is to refer it to the hon. Chairman of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Exactly.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: So, what was happening here...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Without hearing the Member, how .... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has sent the note of dissent ...(*Interruptions*)... The hon. Chairman... (*Interruptions*)... Let me complete. Let there be no confusion about it...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, one minute. Let me speak...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot speak till I finished my words. Please. There are two Chairmen involved; one is the Chairman of the Committee and the other is the hon. Chairman of the House. The note of dissent, in the wisdom of the Chairman of the Committee, was not proper within the rules and directions for the functioning of the Committee and, as I read out just now, under article 1 of the directive of the hon. Chairman of the Rajya Sabha, that matter was taken into account. This whole matter was put before the hon. Chairman. The hon. Chairman has gone through the whole report and that is how he has given the direction. I am bound by that. This decision was taken after everything was put before him. So, now the matter is over...(*Interruptions*)... The matter is over...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: No. Madam, I want to make one thing clear...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not want you to make anything...(*Interruptions*)... No dispute about it. The matter is clarified. There is a difference between the two "Chairmen", one is the Chairman of the Committee. What are the directions by the hon. Chairman and the hon. Speaker of the other House to the Chairman of the Committee, as regards the functioning of the Committee, is one point.

If there is any dispute, it has to be put before the hon. Chairman and the hon. Chairman has gone through it and he has given his direction. That is it...(*Interruptions*)... Now, what are you disputing?

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Madam may I submit one thing? I was very keen since yesterday ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, Sarojji, I cannot allow ...(*Interruptions*)... We have a Calling Attention ...(*Interruptions*)...

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: I did not get an opportunity to talk to the hon. Chairman.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why did you not get an opportunity? You could have gone to his house ...(*Interruptions*)...

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Today morning also I went, but by the time the House ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You should have come earlier ...(*Interruptions*)... I cannot discuss it. (*Interruptions*)... We cannot discuss. Mr. Ashok Mitra ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Are you interested in snatching the rights ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The point is not that ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is the proforma ...*(Interruptions)*... You show me the proforma ... *(Interruptions)*...You show me the proforma.....*(Interruptions)*.....

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Madam, see how Mr. Salim is behaving ...(Interruptions)... What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Where is itwritten ...*(Interruptions)*...You show me .....*(interruptions)*.....Where written.....*(interruptions)*.....You show me such proforma ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: There should not be any controversy in the House after the decision of the hon. Chairman. Madam, there should not be any controversy ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please please sit down. Every Member has a right to go to the hon. Chairman and hon. Chairman's doors are always open. You can go and talk to him anytime. You can go to him at anytime, but not when he is sitting in the Chair. We have taken a lot of time on this. Mr. Ashok Mitra.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA (West Bengal): Madam, I beg to present ...*(Interruptions)*...

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Madam, before he places the report on the Table of the House, I would like to stage a walk-out on this report because my note of dissent is not incorporated in that; that is all. I do not want to be a party to it. Thank you, very much.

(At this stage the hon. Member left the Chamber.)

SHRI ASHOK MITRA: Madam, I beg to present ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Madam, it is very unfortunate that you have snatched the right of the hon. Member. I also go out of the House. (At this stage the hon. Member left the Chamber).

SHRI ASHOK MITRA: I beg to present (i) The Eighteenth Report (in English and Hindi) of the Dpeartment-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Industry on the Demands for Grants (1996-97) of the Ministry of Steel. (ii) The Nineteenth Report (in English and Hindi) of the Department related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Industry on the Demands for Grants (1996-97) of the Ministry of Mines. (iii) The Twentieth Report (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Industry on the Demands for Grants (1996-97) of the Ministry of Industry.

REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT

DR. M. ARAM (Nominated): Madam, I beg to present a copy each in (English and Hindi) of the following reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Human Resource Development:—

(i) Forty-third Report on Demands for Grants 1996-97 of the Department of Culture (Ministry of Human Resource Development);

(ii) Forty-fourth Report on Demands for Grants 1996-97 of the Department of Family Welfare (Ministry of Health and Family Welfare); and

(iii) Forty-fifth Report on Demands for Grants 1996-97 of the Department of Health (Ministry of Health and Family Welfare)

REPORT OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON COMMERCE

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, I beg to present the Twenty-seventh Report (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on